

Comments by Mohan J. Malik on Hnin Yi's paper, "The Political Role of the Military in Myanmar"

I have carefully reviewed the manuscript on "The Political Role of the Military in Myanmar" by Hnin Yi. The paper is soundly structured and is well argued. It seeks to examine domestic political roles of the military and assess how the Myanmar military influences national policies and its implications. The conceptual frameworks employed are those of Finer, Welch, Lovell, Perlmutter, Huntington and others. It does so in the context of Myanmar's history and politics. It is worthy of publication with minor changes and additions.

Having said that, I found it to be more descriptive than analytical. It also does not adequately address possible alternative future roles of the Tatmadaw in the foreseeable future. I would have liked the author to expand the section on p. 20 preceding conclusion and look into different scenarios as pressure grows on the Myanmar government to amend the constitution to allow ASSK to contest elections in 2015 and what would that signal for the possible role of the military in Myanmar's politics. Another glaring omission was any reference to Muthiah Alagappa and similar other Asian scholars' works on civil-military relations in Asian countries.

The paper needs some tighter editing as there are some grammatical and typographical errors (e.g., on p. 10 second para, line 8: "after abolishing the 1947 constitution"; p. 18 second para, line 3: "With tightened (control?) by the..."; p. 19 line 7: delete "the" before "controlling every aspect of ..."; p. 19 line 5 from bottom: "There is (not "are") still room...").